

Online Appendix

Table I. *As planned* endings

Case	Brief Description
Burundi (1972)	Burundian Army targeted Hutu leadership and crushed opposition, achieving its aim of suppressing resistance. The President appointed a new prime minister and government tasked with restoring order.
China (1947-1953)	Following brutal civil war, Communist Party consolidated control and implemented a new national agenda. Violence decreased as the central government finished these campaigns and re-centralized the authority to kill. Persecution continued principally by placing dissenters into labor camps.
China (1966-1976)	The worst of the violence ended after the government wound down the Communist Revolution's central campaigns by the end of 1968. Members of Red Guard and other extremist organizations were crushed by military and sent for rural re-education to restore stability.
D.R. Congo (1996-1997)	Rwanda and the Alliance for Democratic Forces for the Liberation of Congo-Zaire invaded Zaire, targeting Hutu civilians in refugee camps and as they fled. The period ended with the overthrow of the Zairean government of Mobutu Sese Seko. Subsequent violence began in 1998 and its treated as a separate case.
Ethiopia (1976-1985)	The military regime solidified its position with crucial military support from the Soviet Union, crushing and dismantling the urban political opposition. Its brutal counterinsurgency strategy, including resettlement programs, ended partially due to success and international pressure.
Guatemala (1981-1983)	The government's counterinsurgency was largely successful, after which violence declined. Systematic massacres ended nationwide by August of 1983 with the military coup against Rios Montt, though political violence continued through mid-1984 at lower levels.
India (1946-1947)	Partition violence primarily ended as mass migration was completed. However, people continued to migrate at lower levels and with considerably less violence over subsequent years.
Indonesia (1965-1966)	The military gained power, and through a widespread purge, crushed opposition and signaled its willingness to use massive violence if needed. Under presidential orders, General Suharto dissolved the opposition Communist Party of Indonesia (PKI), blacklisting former members from politics.
Indonesia (1975-1980)	Large-scale atrocities subsided as the Timorese resistance lost ground and civilians returned to villages under Indonesian military control (1978), leading to violence more targeted against Timorese leadership. By March 1979 the Indonesian military declared East Timor 'pacified' and ended operations. Significant incidents of killing occurred but were not sustained after 1980.
Iraq (1987-1988)	The August 1988 conclusion to the Iraq-Iran war was followed by the final phase of the Anfal campaign, lasting several days after which the last areas were declared free of Kurdish saboteurs. On September 6, 1988, the Iraqi regime declared its victory by announcing a general amnesty for all Kurds and large-scale offensives ended. Lower levels of persecution and killing continued through April 23, 1989, when the regime considered its objectives to have been accomplished.
Liberia (1989-1996)	By 1996, Charles Taylor's insurgent forces had achieved military dominance. With the war formally ending in an internationally mediated peace process, atrocities were no longer necessary. Taylor subsequently won national elections in May 1997.
Nigeria (1966-1970)	Atrocities ended with the collapse of the separatist Biafran state and its military defeat by the Nigerian government, which declared a policy of 'no victor, no vanquished.'
Soviet Union (1945-1953)	Post-1945, POWs were used for labor, causing many deaths. Killing the POWs was not a goal but was not prevented. As projects were completed and Soviet leaders decided it was politically beneficial to release POWs. We thus code this <i>as planned</i> because the POWs fulfilled the political and labor goals the government had for them.

Case	Brief Description
Sri Lanka (2009)	The government of Sri Lanka definitively defeated the separatist LTTE militarily. Lower levels of lethal violence in IDP camps more slowly concluded as the number of IDPs decreased.
Sudan (Darfur) (2003-2004)	The principal drop in atrocities, marked by the N'djamena Humanitarian Ceasefire Agreement in April 2004, occurred when the government achieved its primary military objectives and the army exhausted its supplies, limiting its capacity. (Note: A possible secondary cause was international political pressure – particularly from the African Union – to gain greater humanitarian access, but it is difficult to know if this would have been possible without the military objectives being first met.)
Yugoslavia (1945-1948)	The decline in atrocities occurred initially as opposing armed and political groups, and civilians associated with them, were identified and deemed under control. By 1948, Tito's regime consolidated power.

Table II. Endings by defeat of perpetrator

Case	Description
Afghanistan (1979-1988)	Violence declined significantly with the Soviet withdrawal. Subsequent violence over 5,000 annual civilians deaths was caused by warlords and the Taliban; data is poor for this period, but it is possible that the trend continued until the Taliban consolidated control in 1998.
Angola (1992-2002)	By August 1999 the government decided on a military solution to defeating UNITA and quickly regained several of UNITA's core territories, killing its leader, Savimbi in February 2002, leading to a ceasefire and concession of defeat.
Indochina (1945-1959)	Violence significantly declined following the French withdrawal after it was militarily defeated. Subsequent violence over 5,000 annual civilian killings occurred until the new governments in the north and south consolidated control in 1959.
Rwanda (1994)	The overwhelming number of deaths – 500,000 to 800,000 – were perpetrated by the Interim Government and ended when the RPF defeated it. Subsequent killings continued into 1995, including at least 5,000 civilians killed by the RPF at Kibeho IDP camp, in efforts to establish the new regime's control, and during cross border incursions by remnants of the earlier regime, concluding when the new regime consolidated power; subsequent RPF killings in Zaire are treated in a separate case.
Somalia (1988-1991)	At the end of 1990, the United Somali Congress launched an offensive on Mogadishu, and on 27 January 1991, President Siad Barre fled the capital. Subsequent violence was perpetrated by various Somali warlords thereafter, through international intervention, and likely only falling below 5,000 annual deaths in 1993.
Sierra Leone (1991-1999)	Atrocities ended as the RUF neared defeat in early 2000, largely due to escalated fighting supported by UK forces.
Uganda (1980-1986)	Violence fell below our threshold when Museveni's NRA took control of the country in January 1986.
Uganda (1971-1979)	Backed by the Tanzanian army, the Ugandan National Liberation Front overthrew Idi Amin on April 11, 1979.
Vietnam (1965-1975)	U.S. forces negotiated an exit under the Paris Peace Accords in January 1973. Atrocities continued with ongoing fighting until both the war and atrocities were definitively ended when Saigon fell in April 1975.
Bangladesh (1971)	By October 1971, the war between Pakistan and Bangladeshi resistance had stalemated. Indian involvement escalated to full military intervention on December 3. On December 16 the Pakistani administration crumbled and the army surrendered. West Pakistan was soundly defeated and Bangladesh emerged as a sovereign nation.

Case	Description
Cambodia (1975-1979)	In January of 1979, Vietnamese forces took control of the capital; Pol Pot and the remaining Khmer Rouge leadership fled to the Southwest of the country, and the People's Republic of Kampuchea was established, marking the end of mass atrocities.

Table III. Endings by strategic shift

Case	Description
Algeria (1954-1962)	In 1962, though France had considerable military success against the insurgent FLN, French brutality alienated its domestic citizens and the international community. This allowed the FLN to achieve most of its demands when France chose instead to withdraw and negotiate peace, including complete autonomy. Subsequent violence extended into post-independence with assaults by Algerian forces against the Harki and Europeans as the new government consolidated control later the same year.
Algeria (1992-1998)	With the failure to win militarily, the government began making political agreements with more moderate insurgents in 1997. This strengthened moderate positions within both government and insurgent groups, though atrocity events occurred through 1998. By 1999 enough insurgents had moderated and accepted political agreements for the atrocities to end, though lower violence continued thereafter.
Angola (1961-1974)	Violence declined when Portugal, after a coup in 1974, ceased to resist independence.
Burundi (1993-2000)	Overwhelming violence perpetrated by the Army failed to defeat the Hutu rebellion and the civil war stagnated into a bloody stalemate, with voices on both sides calling for negotiated solutions. International pressure altered government policies in internment camps and internationally led mediation produced a peace agreement in 2000.
Cambodia (1965-1973)	The U.S. bombing of Cambodia came to a halt in August of 1973 when the US Congress legislated its conclusion, following the signing of a peace agreement between the US and North Vietnamese.
Colombia (1948-1953)	In 1953 the military junta declared a general amnesty, which 6,500 guerrilla fighters accepted. Party leadership, surprised by severe escalation of violence, were willing to compromise their initial goals, reining in the army, paramilitary groups, and the civilian police. The National Front government effectively created a political alternative to violence, establishing a power-sharing agreement between Liberal and Conservative parties.
DRC (1998-2003)	Atrocities declined due to the convergence of several factors: the withdrawal of the most powerful armed actors, invading national armies as part of an internationally-mediated peace process; increased UN peacekeeping presence; and progress in the national political process.
E. Guinea (1969-1979)	Macias was overthrown in a coup by his nephew. Despite a retaliatory blood bath killing approximately 400 people over the next two-weeks, mass violence committed by the regime immediately ended, political prisoners were freed, forced labor ceased, and amnesty was granted.

Case	Description
El Salvador (1980-1985)	The decrease in civilian deaths appears to be partly the result of international pressure to curb violence against civilians, and partly due to patterns in the armed conflict which ultimately resulted in the government winning an incomplete victory in the conventional warfare, before the insurgents shifted to limited, asymmetrical guerilla warfare.
Iraq (2003-2009)	Declines in violence began in 2007 but remained above 5,000 annually until 2009. The lull lasted only until 2013. It was possible as multiple factors converged to produce a moderating dynamic: Sunni military losses, the US 'surge' and reoriented counter insurgency; the Awakening movement; 'success' of sectarian cleansing; standing down of the Mahdi Army; and growing capacity of the Iraqi state and security forces. Together, these forces created a political opening.
Korea (1948-1953)	Civilian fatalities declined as the conflict stalemated in 1951, but killing of POWs continued until the July 1953 armistice.
Mozambique (1964-1973)	Atrocities ended abruptly when Portugal's 1974 military coup led to a policy of ending its wars against independence. FRELIMO was recognized as the legitimate government on June 25, 1975, and Portuguese forces withdrew.
Mozambique (1981-1992)	With the loss of foreign support to both sides, FRELIMO initiated the first round of peace talks in 1989 then approved a new constitution permitting multi-party elections in 1990, appealing to RENAMO power-sharing demands. Though RENAMO's violent tactics continued as talks progress, a ceasefire and the General Peace Accords were signed in October 1992.
Poland (1945 – 1947)	Initially, expulsion of Germans was very violent. This violence decreased in response to moderating efforts by international actors – particularly Allied forces and a bilateral agreement with the UK.
Russia (Chechnya) (1994-1996)	Atrocities subsided as the war reached a stalemate, leading in August 1996 to a settlement in which the Russian military withdrew. Chechen independence was not discussed, but was <i>de facto</i> established until 1999, when a new war began.
Sudan (South) (1983-2005)	While 2005 does not mark a clear-cut or permanent end to mass violence, after numerous rounds of fighting and talking, and in the context of stalemate on the battlefield, moderate voices prevailed in forging a (heavily internationalized) settlement including deployment of peacekeeping forces. Parallel violence occurred in western Sudan.
US bombing of Cambodia (1965-1973)	US bombing of Cambodia came to a halt in August of 1973 when the US Congress legislated its conclusion, following the signing of a peace agreement between the US and North Vietnamese. Subsequent violence during the civil war and rise of the Khmer Rouge is treated as a separate case.

Table IV. Alternate endings

Case	Description
China (1966-1976)	<i>As planned</i> → <i>Strategic shift</i> . Though the specific campaigns of violence ending in 1976 appear to end as-planned, one could instead look to the longer sequence of events from 1966-1976, and note that they finally ended following the death of Mao Tse-tung and ascendance of Deng Xiaoping, whose approach was broadly more moderate.
E. Guinea (1969-1979)	<i>Strategic shift</i> → <i>Defeat</i> . If the coup is counted as a 'defeat' of the Macias government, rather than an internal change of leadership, coding would change.
India (1946-1947)	<i>As planned</i> → <i>Strategic shift</i> . The decrease in violence could be deemed to be the result of moderation, rather than a fully successful set of ethnic cleansing tactics.
Indochina (1945-1959)	<i>Defeat</i> → <i>Strategic shift</i> . The French suffered military losses that pushed it to engage in a cease-fire agreement, which could be interpreted as moderation rather than all-out defeat.
Iraq (2003-2009)	<i>Strategic shift</i> → <i>Defeat</i> . Although it did not resemble a traditional military defeat, the use of force played a significant role in defeating terrorist elements (by both US and Sunni armed actors) and the subsequent stand-down of the Mahdi Army on the Shi'ite side. (The latter, however, may be considered moderation or even as planned, given successful ethnic cleansing in Baghdad).
Liberia (1989-1996)	<i>As planned</i> → <i>Strategic shift</i> . The conflict ended with Taylor in power, as was his goal, but there was an international mediation effort that helped usher in the elections that brought him to power. Hence, this could be coded as 'moderation.'
Poland (1945-1947)	<i>Strategic shift</i> → <i>As planned</i> . The expulsions of Germans was largely accomplished by the time that the pressure to moderate policies resulted in changes that reduced civilian deaths.
Soviet Union (1945-1953)	<i>As planned</i> → <i>Strategic shift</i> . The decrease in deaths of German POWs could be viewed as the result of a Soviet shift toward moderation with the death of Stalin.
Sudan (2003-2004)	<i>As planned</i> → <i>Strategic shift</i> . It is possible to read the decline in atrocities as the result of international pressure given the global visibility of the violence.

Table V. Foreign armed interventions

Case	Type of intervention	Context	Relationship to atrocity ending
Afghanistan (1979-1988)	Unilateral	USSR intervention causes overwhelming number of civilian deaths, and US support to armed forces	Withdrawal contributes to ending.
Algeria (1954-1962)	Colonial	French efforts to retain colony cause overwhelming number of civilian deaths	Withdrawal most important factor for ending
Angola (1961-1974)	Colonial	Portuguese efforts to retain colony cause overwhelming number of civilian deaths	Withdrawal most important factor for ending
Angola (1992-2002)	UN	United Nations Angola Verification Mission (UNAVEM) deployed in 1988; augmented to a peacekeeping mission in 1994	No relationship to ending
Bangladesh (1971)	Unilateral	West Pakistan intervention into East Pakistan; Indian intervention into East Pakistan	Intervention defeats primary perpetrator
Burundi (1993-2000)	AU/UN forces	Called for in peace agreement (2000), the AU Force (AMIB) deployed 2003, transformed into UN force (2004)	Post-atrocity deployment
Cambodia (1975-1979)	Unilateral	Vietnamese intervention concludes period	Intervention defeats primary perpetrator
DRC (1998-2003)	Unilateral, UN	Intervention by neighboring states in support of government (Zimbabwe, Angola and Namibia) and opposing it (Rwanda, Uganda); UN peacekeeping force (MONUC 1999 -, MONUSCO 2010 - present), short-term EU interventionary force (2003)	Withdrawal of neighboring forces most important factor; with intervention of UN forces also significant
Indochina (1945-1955)	Colonial	French forces defeated	Withdrawal most important factor for ending
Iraq (1987-1988)	Context of international armed conflict	Iran-Iraq war provided the context for atrocities, which continue for a short period after the war's conclusion.	Primary ending is 'as planned,' conflict termination a factor
Iraq (2003-2009)	Context of International armed conflict	Intervention by a US-led coalition provides the context for mass atrocities and causes highest single month spike in killing. By some analysis, the drawdown in international forces enabled a subsequent spike in atrocities	Drawdown of forces coincides with decline, not causal. Moderating influence

Case	Type of intervention	Context	Relationship to atrocity ending
Korea (1948-1953)	Context of International armed conflict	International armed conflict with both sides committing atrocities	Stalemate in conflict contributes to ending
Liberia (1989-1996)	ECOWAS/UN	ECOMOG deployed 1990; UN Observer Missions (UNOMIL) in 1993; expanded mandate March 1993	No significant impact
Mozambique (1964-1973)	Colonial	Portuguese efforts to retain colony cause overwhelming number of civilian deaths	Withdrawal most important factor for ending
Mozambique (1981-1992)	UN	ONUMOZ authorized in December 1992	Post-atrocity deployment
Poland (1945-1947)	Post-WWII Allied	USSR forces stationed in Poland following end of WWII	Primary cause is moderation, under significant international pressure; No significant military impact
Rwanda (1994)	UN	UNAMIR in place at onset, and French intervention late	No significant impact
Sierra Leone (1991-1999)	ECOWAS/UN	ECOMOG 1997; observer mission, UNOMISIL 1998; UN peacekeeping UNAMSIL in 1999, augmented in 2000, with UK intervention	Intervention most important factor for ending dynamic
Somalia (1988-1991)	UN	UN Forces begin deployment in July 1992; augmented as UNITAF in Dec 1992 – May 1993; given robust mandate in March 1993; significant withdrawals begin in March 1994	Post-atrocity deployment
Sudan (2003-2005)	AU/UN	AMIS I (May 2004) augmented to AMIS II (October 2004); UNAMID (deployed Jan 2008)	Primary cause is ‘as planned,’ intervention played a role in the ending dynamics
Sudan (1983-2005)	UN	UNMIS (2005-2011)	Post-atrocity deployment
Uganda (1971-1979)	Unilateral	Tanzanian intervention to overthrow Idi Amin	Intervention defeats primary perpetrator
Vietnam (1965-1975)	Unilateral	US intervention to defeat North Vietnamese regime	Withdrawal most important factor for ending

Case	Type of intervention	Context	Relationship to atrocity ending
Cambodia (1965-1973)	Unilateral	US bombing as expansion of Vietnam War	Withdrawal most important factor for ending.
DRC (1996-1997)	Unilateral	Rwandan intervention to overthrow government	Withdrawal most important factor for ending.

Table VI. Mass Atrocity-Related Datasets

Dataset	Phenomenon	Fatality threshold	Intent criteria	Perpetrator criteria	Victim criteria	Years
Harff 2003	Genocide/politicide (37 cases)	None	Intent to destroy in whole or part	State affiliated groups	Identifiable ethnic, religious or political group, self-defined or imposed.	1955 – 2003
Hultman and Eck 2007	One-sided violence, Event dataset, numbers of discrete events as reported in media.	Min. 25 deaths per year	Intentional and direct killing	State and non-state formally organized groups.	Civilians	1989 – 2004
Ulfelder and Valentino 2008	Mass Killing (120 events), during intra-state conflicts	1,000	Direct and indirect killing, where death is an anticipatable outcome of actions.	State agents	Discrete group	1946-2006; start date first year over 100 noncombatant deaths, end date three years below this level.
Bellamy 2011	Mass killing (103 episodes), inter- and intra-state conflicts, as well as peacetime.	5,000	Intentional, including induced famine and indiscriminate targeting	State and non-state	Civilian	1945 – 2010
Straus 2015	Large-scale violence against civilians in sub-Saharan Africa, (34 cases).	Average out to at least 1,000 deaths per year.	Death, both direct and indirect violence.	State and non-state	Civilian	1960 – 2008
Political Instability Task Force 2009	Atrocities, in context of a wider political or military conflict. Event dataset, with numbers from discrete events as reported in media.	5 or more deaths.	Deliberate killing	Excludes US actors.	Civilians and noncombatants, including soldiers hors de combat. Excludes US actors.	1995 – 2012, 2013 – present (with a four month lag).
Bellamy 2015	Endings of mass killing, 65 cases.	5,000 min.	Intentional killing	Forces associated with government of country in which killing occurs.	Civilians	1945 – 2015